



Argumentative Essay Example

Does America Need “Aliens”?



Daniel Perez,
Student Ambassador

MCKINLEY TECHNOLOGY
HIGH SCHOOL

Millions of immigrants come to America each year. They come for different reasons: job

opportunities, starting a new life, better rights, and many more. Everyone deserves these basic human rights; however, many nations in the world do not offer the types of economic and social opportunities that America does. For this reason, a lot of immigrants come to the United States without legal documentation or permission. Law enforcement workers from the states that border Mexico — especially California, Arizona, and Texas — search for undocumented immigrants, who some call “aliens,” and many times deport them back to their home country. The United States should allow more immigrants to enter the country and should create more pathways for them to become citizens because they help improve the economy, they bring diversity and culture to the United States, and they contribute strong talent to America’s job force.

First, immigrants, undocumented or here legally, strengthen the US’s economy. According to an article written by the Center for American Progress titled “Immigrants Are Makers, Not Takers,” a 2011 study by the Institute of Taxation and Economic Policy “found that immigrants paid \$11.2 billion in state and local taxes in 2010 alone” (Fitz, Wolgin, Oakford). This proves that immigrants participate in the American economy and help make it stronger. If immigrants got kicked out of the U.S., our economy may become weaker without these billions of dollars in tax revenue. This tax revenue goes to fund schools, maintain roads, and benefit all citizens. Allowing aliens to obtain citizenship will strengthen our economy. According to the study mentioned



above, “Legalizing our nation’s undocumented immigrant population and reforming our legal immigration system would add a cumulative \$1.5 trillion to U.S. GDP over a decade” (Fitz, Wolgin, Oakford). Immigrants are contributing economically to our country; for this reason, they should be able to stay.

Secondly, immigrants are known to bring diversity and culture into the United States, which in turn can make citizens have more compassion and empathy for others. Messerli explains, “Diversity brings more tolerance for people that are, on the surface, different than us.” When different people from different countries come to the U.S., they bring more culture and diversity, which is to be appreciated. The United States becomes a more “colorful” country. Citizens will benefit greatly by having a Spanish-speaking friend who can teach them Spanish, or a Muslim friend who can share the traditions of their Muslim faith. The United States needs to be less globally isolated. “Unlike people living in most European countries, Americans rarely travel outside of their homeland — only 30% have passports” (Kelly). Because most Americans do not travel, it is important to allow immigrants into the country so that American citizens can be exposed to the truth and develop a deep appreciation for diversity. Students will benefit from being able to experience and interact with peers who represent multiple cultures and languages in the classroom.

©2020 One World Education





Lastly, the United States should welcome immigrants into the country because it strengthens our job force. According to her article in *The Huffington Post*, Nataly Kelly shares that "...businesses simply cannot locate enough high-quality engineers to remain competitive in a globalized era" (Kelly). One of the many ways that immigration helps strengthen the U.S. is that the U.S. is able to

retain some of the top talent in law, medicine, and engineering circles. Kelly goes on to say, "In the dynamic and often cutthroat business world, companies cannot afford to sit back and hope that the American education system will eventually catch up." When the United States allowed a Jewish man by the name of Albert Einstein to find refuge from Adolph Hitler, Einstein shared some of the greatest mathematical and scientific facts ever known to mankind. Our country thrives when many talented, hardworking immigrants come, and it is proud of the freedom and liberty it offers.

On the other hand, some people may think that the high number of undocumented immigrants in the U.S. may be taking American citizens' jobs. Some people believe that "If you pump millions of new workers seeking new jobs, it decreases the amount of work available" (Messerli). Many people are scared of immigrants coming to America and taking jobs that Americans are competing for. But this is not the case, since immigrants actually end up taking low-paying jobs that very few Americans would want to take. Many people who immigrate to the U.S. have low skills and thus apply for low-skilled jobs. According to another text, "fewer U.S. born workers are competing for jobs requiring less education, the kind immigrants generally get. So immigrants are replacing, not displacing U.S. born workers" (Enchautegui). This demonstrates that the immigrants usually take low-paying jobs and that they probably don't steal jobs that Americans wanted to take. Sometimes, immigrants must do this to help their families out in their own countries.

©2020 One World Education

Many people's ancestors came to America in hopes of a better life. The Pilgrims came to America for better economic opportunity. The Puritans came here for religious freedom. And today, we see many Syrians and people fleeing from civil wars. America should take steps to welcome refugees and talented doctors, lawyers, and all types of immigrants because they strengthen our economy, bring culture and diversity, and contribute talent to our job force.

Works Cited

Enchautegui, Maria E. "Immigrants are Replacing, Not Displacing, Workers." *The New York Times*, 6 Jan. 2015, www.nytimes.com/roomfordebate/2015/01/06/do-immigrants-take-jobs-from-american-born-workers/immigrants-are-replacing-not-displacing-workers. Accessed 9 Aug. 2019.

Fitz, Marshall, Phillip E. Wolgin, and Patrick Oakford. "Immigrants Are Makers, Not Takers." *Center for American Progress*, 8 Feb. 2013, www.americanprogress.org/issues/immigration/news/2013/02/08/52377/immigrants-are-makers-not-takers/. Accessed 31 Mar. 2016.

Kelly, Nataly. "Seven Surprising Ways Immigration Helps Build a Stronger America." *Huff Post*, 23 Jan. 2013, www.huffpost.com/entry/immigration-benefits_b_2523562. Accessed 31 Mar. 2016.

Messerli, Joe. "Should America Maintain/ Increase the Level of Legal Immigration?" *BalancedPolitics.org*, 1 Jan. 2012, balancedpolitics.org/immigration.htm. Accessed 31 Mar. 2016.





Vocabulary and Sample Paragraph

Argumentative Writing Vocabulary

Claim	A statement that expresses a belief that you want to prove by laying out your problem and explaining a solution.
Evidence	Specific data or information that supports your claim.
Warrant	An explanation of how the data supports your claim.
Counterclaim	An explanation of evidence that opposes the claim.
Rebuttal	Evidence that disagrees with or disproves the counterclaim.



Sample Argumentative Paragraph Exercise

The paragraph below was taken from a former One World Student Ambassador, Daniel Perez, who chose to tackle the topic of immigration. His complete essay is on pages 10–11. This paragraph contains a counterclaim, significant data points that disprove the counterclaim, and an explanation of how the data supports his claim.

Directions: For each part of the paragraph below, identify if it is a **claim, evidence, warrant, counterclaim** or **rebuttal**.

	On the other hand, some people may think that the high number of undocumented immigrants in the U.S. may be taking American citizens' jobs.
	Some people believe that "If you pump millions of new workers seeking new jobs, it decreases the amount of work available" (Messerli).
	Many people are scared of immigrants coming to America and taking jobs that Americans are competing for.
	But this is not the case, since immigrants actually end up taking low-paying jobs that very few Americans would want to take. Many people who immigrate to the U.S. have low skills and thus apply for low-skilled jobs.
	According to another text, "fewer U.S. born workers are competing for jobs requiring less education, the kind immigrants generally get. So immigrants are replacing, not displacing, U.S. born workers" (Enchautegui).
	This demonstrates that the immigrants usually take low paying jobs and that they probably don't steal jobs that Americans wanted to take. Sometimes, immigrants must do this to help their families out in their own countries.

©2020 One World Education



Topics to Consider for Your Essay

This may be one of the first writing assignments where you get to choose the topic from a list of issues that affect you.

Your argumentative essay, around a cultural or global issue of your choice, will both explain the problem you see with that issue and suggest a solution to that problem.

In order to do this, you will need to deeply explore the issue you choose and what you really think about it.

This One World Journal will help you with the process of choosing your own path. Navigate the One World Education website and familiarize yourself with possible topics to research

Possible topics: Topics shown in **bold** are featured on the One World Website.

Arts & Media	Civics & History	Science & Health
Cultural Appropriation	DC Statehood	Affordable Health Care
Diversity in Media	Gun Laws	Climate Change
Historic Symbols	Immigration	Covid-19 Response
Violent Video Games	Voting Rights	Vaccinations
Value of Arts Education	U.S. Foreign Policy	Vaping
School & Career	Identity & Family	Morality & Ethics
Costs of College	Domestic Violence	Animal Testing
Effects of Stress	Family Leave Policies	The Death Penalty
Financial Aid Funding	Gender Equality	Drone Warfare
School to Prison Pipeline	LGBTQ Rights	Voting Rights for Felons



Brainstorming Topics

Directions: You reviewed the list of potential topics on page 13 and explored the topics on the One World Education website: www.oneworldeducation.org. Now brainstorm a list of topics and problems you are interested in. After you complete your list and discuss with your teacher and/or classmates, place a star ★ next to the topic that is the most interesting to you.

Example:	
Topic	Problem
What is the general topic ? Immigration	What is the specific problem you want to focus on? The U.S. does not allow enough refugees to re-settle in the U.S.
Your Topics	
Possible topic A:	Problem: Identify a specific problem to focus on.
.....
.....
.....
Possible topic B:	Problem: Identify a specific problem to focus on.
.....
.....
.....
Possible topic C:	Problem: Identify a specific problem to focus on.
.....
.....
.....
Possible topic D:	Problem: Identify a specific problem to focus on.
.....
.....
.....





Close Read: Paragraph 1

Example from pages 10–11:
Does America Need “Aliens”?

Directions (pages 15–20): You will do a close read of Daniel’s essay, broken down paragraph by paragraph, to examine not only the argumentative elements he includes, but also how he makes his argument.

You will read and answer questions about his essay two times:

- **Close Read 1:** Read to understand the elements of the essay.
- **Close Read 2:** Read to analyze how he makes his argument.

“Millions of immigrants come to America each year. They come for different reasons: job opportunities, starting a new life, better rights, and many more. Everyone deserves these basic human rights; however, many nations in the world do not offer the types of economic and social opportunities that America does. For this reason, a lot of immigrants come to the United States without legal documentation or permission. Law enforcement workers from the states that border Mexico –

especially California, Arizona, and Texas– search for undocumented immigrants, who some call “aliens,” and many times deport them back to their home country. The United States should allow more immigrants to enter the country and should create more pathways for them to become citizens because they help improve the economy, they bring diversity and culture to the United States, and they contribute strong talent to America’s job force.”

Close Read 1

Clarifying Questions

1. Circle the different reasons immigrants come to America each year.

2. What is an “alien”? *Stop and Jot*

.....

3. Identify the problem Daniel is researching:

Stop and Jot

.....

.....

.....

4. Identify the three reasons Daniel lists that support his solution:

1.

.....

2.

.....

3.

.....

©2020 One World Education

Close Read 2

Analysis Questions

1. How does Daniel’s inclusion of immigrant stories bring attention to the issue? *Think-Pair-Share*

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

2. Evaluate Daniel’s claim: is it strong, concise, and effective? Why or why not? *Think-Pair-Share*

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....





Close Read: Paragraph 2

Example from pages 10–11:
Does America Need “Aliens”?

“First, immigrants, undocumented or here legally, strengthen the US’s economy. According to an article written by the Center for American Progress titled “Immigrants Are Makers, Not Takers,” a 2011 study by the Institute of Taxation and Economic Policy “found that immigrants paid \$11.2 billion in state and local taxes in 2010 alone” (Fitz, Wolgin, Oakford). This proves that immigrants participate in the American economy and help make it stronger. If immigrants got kicked out of the U.S., our economy may become weaker without these billions of dollars in tax

revenue. This tax revenue goes to fund schools, maintain roads, and benefit all citizens. Allowing aliens to obtain citizenship will strengthen our economy. According to the study mentioned above, “Legalizing our nation’s undocumented immigrant population and reforming our legal immigration system would add a cumulative \$1.5 trillion to U.S. GDP over a decade” (Fitz, Wolgin, Oakford). Immigrants are contributing economically to our country; for this reason, they should be able to stay. ”

Close Read 1

Clarifying Questions

1. Underline Daniel’s first reason.
2. Circle the evidence used to support this claim and underline the warrant.
3. If immigrants are kicked out of the U.S., how will this affect the American economy? *Stop and Jot*
4. According to the data, how will aliens strengthen the economy? *Stop and Jot*

Close Read 2

Analysis Questions

1. In your own words, describe Daniel’s first reason:
2. Evaluate the data point: What makes this evidence effective in supporting his reason? *Turn & Talk*
3. Evaluate Daniel’s warrant: Describe the methods he uses to support his reason:



Close Read: Paragraph 3

Example from pages 10–11:
Does America Need “Aliens”?

“Secondly, immigrants are known to bring diversity and culture into the United States, which in turn can make citizens have more compassion and empathy for others. Messerli explains, “Diversity brings more tolerance for people that are, on the surface, different than us.” When different people from different countries come to the U.S., they bring more culture and diversity, which is to be appreciated. The United States becomes a more “colorful” country. Citizens will benefit greatly by having a Spanish speaking friend who can teach them Spanish, or a Muslim friend who can share the traditions of their

Muslim faith. The United States needs to be less globally isolated. “Unlike people living in most European countries, Americans rarely travel outside of their homeland — only 30% have passports” (Kelly). Because most Americans do not travel, it is important to allow immigrants into the country so that American citizens can be exposed to the truth and develop a deep appreciation for diversity. Students will benefit from being able to experience and interact with peers who represent multiple cultures and languages in the classroom.

Close Read 1

Clarifying Questions

1. Underline Daniel’s second reason.
2. Circle the transition word used.
3. Identify the two pieces of evidence Daniel lists that support his second main point:
 1.
 2.
4. Underline Daniel’s warrant.
5. How will students and American citizens benefit from exposure to immigrants? *Turn & Talk*

©2020 One World Education

Close Read 2

Analysis Questions

1. Evaluate the second reason: Is it a strong, valid reason? *Stop and Jot*
.....
2. Is it consistent with the thesis? *Stop and Jot*
.....
3. What rhetorical appeal does Daniel rely upon in this paragraph? *Think-Pair-Share*
.....
4. Which piece of evidence is the most effective at supporting the paragraph claim? *Stop and Jot*
.....
5. Rewrite the last sentence in the paragraph so it connects to the solution in his claim: *Stop and Jot*
.....





Close Read: Paragraph 4

Example from pages 10–11:
Does America Need “Aliens”?

“Lastly, the United States should welcome immigrants into the country because it strengthens our job force. According to her article in *The Huffington Post*, Nataly Kelly shares that “...businesses simply cannot locate enough high-quality engineers to remain competitive in a globalized era” (Kelly). One of the many ways that immigration helps strengthen the U.S. is that the U.S. is able to retain some of the top talent in law, medicine, and engineering circles. Kelly goes on to say, “In the dynamic and often cutthroat

business world, companies cannot afford to sit back and hope that the American education system will eventually catch up.” When the United States allowed a Jewish man by the name of Albert Einstein to find refuge from Adolph Hitler, Einstein shared some of the greatest mathematical and scientific facts ever known to mankind. Our country thrives when many talented, hardworking immigrants come, and it is proud of the freedom and liberty it offers.”

Close Read 1

Clarifying Questions

1. Underline Daniel’s third reason.
2. Restate the first piece of evidence in your own words: *Stop and Jot*
.....
.....
.....
3. Summarize the second piece of evidence: *Stop and Jot*
.....
.....
.....
4. Circle the scientist to whom Daniel alludes.
5. According to the author, when/how does our country thrive? *Stop and Jot*
.....
.....
.....
.....

Close Read 2

Analysis Questions

1. How does the second piece of evidence support the paragraph’s purpose? *Think-Pair-Share*
.....
.....
.....
2. Why do you think Daniel includes this information about Einstein? *Stop and Jot*
.....
.....
.....
3. How could Daniel improve his word choice here to connect to the problem-solution framework? *Turn & Talk*
.....
.....
.....



Close Read: Paragraph 5

Example from pages 10–11:
Does America Need “Aliens”?

“On the other hand, some people may think that the high number of undocumented immigrants in the U.S. may be taking American citizens’ jobs. Some people believe that “If you pump millions of new workers seeking new jobs, it decreases the amount of work available” (Messerli). Many people are scared of immigrants coming to America and taking jobs that Americans are competing for. But this is not the case, since immigrants actually end up taking low-paying jobs that very few Americans would want to take. Many people who immigrate to the

U.S. have low skills and thus apply for low skilled jobs. According to another text, “fewer U.S. born workers are competing for jobs requiring less education, the kind immigrants generally get. So immigrants are replacing, not displacing U.S. born workers” (Enchautegui). This demonstrates that the immigrants usually take low paying jobs and that they probably don’t steal jobs that Americans wanted to take. Sometimes, immigrants must do this to help their families out in their own countries.”

Close Read 1

Clarifying Questions

1. Underline the counterclaim.
2. Underline Daniel’s warrant.
3. According to Daniel, of what are people afraid?
Stop and Jot

.....

.....

.....

.....

4. What piece of evidence is used to refute the counterclaim? *Stop and Jot*

.....

.....

.....

.....

©2020 One World Education

Close Read 2

Analysis Questions

1. Is this a strong counterclaim to the immigration crisis? Why or why not? *Think-Pair-Share*

.....

.....

.....

2. Is this piece of evidence strong enough to refute the counterclaim? *Stop and Jot*

.....

.....

.....

3. What rhetorical appeal is Daniel using in the concluding sentence? Is it effective? *Jot & Talk*

.....

.....

.....





Close Read: Paragraph 6

Example from pages 10–11:
Does America Need “Aliens”?

“Many people’s ancestors came to America in hopes of a better life. The Pilgrims came to America for better economic opportunity. The Puritans came here for religious freedom. And today, we see many Syrians and people fleeing from civil wars. America should take steps to welcome refugees and talented doctors, lawyers, and all types of immigrants because they strengthen our economy, bring culture and diversity, and contribute talent to our job force.”

Close Read 1

Clarifying Questions

1. List the three different immigrant groups the author refers to in the conclusion.

1. _____

2. _____

3. _____

Close Read 2

Analysis Questions

1. Why does the author reference these particular immigrant groups who have come to America? *Stop and Jot*

2. How does the information about these three different groups support his proposed solution? *Think-Pair-Share*

3. Is the tone taken toward these groups subjective or objective? *Jot and Talk*

4. How could Daniel revise the conclusion to emphasize his solutions? *Turn & Talk*

©2020 One World Education





Evaluating Claims and Evidence

Read the questions below and write your answer in the space provided.

1. What is Daniel's claim and how does it introduce it?

.....
.....
.....
.....

2. What evidence best supports Daniel's claim? How is the evidence relevant to his argument?

.....
.....
.....
.....

3. How does Daniel rebut the counterclaim?

.....
.....
.....
.....

4. What solution does Daniel propose for the problem?

.....
.....
.....
.....

5. How effective is Daniel's argument? Explain your reasoning with with specific examples from the text.

.....
.....
.....
.....
.....
.....





Reading Comprehension

Read each sentence carefully and choose the best answer. These questions are based on Daniel's essay pages 10–11.

1. In what sentence does Daniel reveal his claim?

- "Unless you are a Native American, you too are an immigrant."
- "Immigrants are contributing economically to our country; for this reason, they should be able to stay."
- "When different people from different countries come to the U.S., they bring more culture and diversity, which is to be appreciated."
- "The United States should allow more immigrants to enter the country and should create more pathways for them to become citizens because they help improve the economy, they bring diversity and culture to the United States, and they contribute strong talent to America's job force."

2. What is the meaning of the term "alien" as used in paragraph 1?

- outsider
- citizen
- unwelcomed
- undocumented

3. What is the main purpose of alluding to Albert Einstein?

- to prove that immigrants strengthen the economy of our country
- to critique the counterclaim that immigrants take away jobs from Americans
- to illustrate how our country thrives when we welcome immigrants to the country
- to applaud the United States government for its decision to welcome Einstein to the country

4. Select a quote that best supports your response to question number 3:

- "Einstein shared some of the greatest mathematical and scientific facts ever known to mankind."
- "Businesses simply cannot locate enough high-quality engineers to remain competitive in a globalized era."
- "Many people are scared of immigrants coming to America and taking jobs that Americans are competing for."
- "Some people believe that 'If you pump millions of new workers seeking new jobs, it decreases the amount of work available.'"

4. Which paragraph from the essay mostly relies upon pathos to persuade the audience?

- paragraph 2
- paragraph 3
- paragraph 4
- paragraph 5

